# Protecting Farmland in Cariboo Regional District

Cariboo Regional District Committee of Whole
January 14, 2021

David J. Connell, PhD MCIP RPP
Associate Professor
Ecosystem Science and Management
University of Northern British Columbia

## How good are government policies that aim to protect farmland in Canada?



Source: https://duckduckgo.com/?q=100+mile+house+bc&t=ffab&ia=web&iaxm=maps

Horse Lake, BC

### Strength of provincial legislative frameworks for farmland protection

Province	Overall Strength
Québec	Strong
British Columbia (1)	Somewhat Strong
Ontario – Greenbelt	Somewhat Strong
Ontario – Prov. Policy Statement	Moderate
Nova Scotia	Somewhat Weak
British Columbia (2) Oil and Gas Comm.	Somewhat Weak
Manitoba	Somewhat Weak
Saskatchewan	Somewhat Weak
Prince Edward Island	Weak
Newfoundland	Weak
New Brunswick	Weak
Alberta	Weak

Source: [updated version] Connell, David J., W. Caldwell, C. Bryant, G. Cameron, T. Johnston, and M. Margulis (2016). Farmland: A Prerequisite for Farmers, Food -- and Agri-food Policy. Prince George, BC: University of Northern British Columbia. On-line: http://www.aglup.org/uploads/1/1/6/6/116674177/aglup policy brief 603.pdf

French: http://www.aglup.org/uploads/1/1/6/6/116674177/aglup policy brief 603-french.pdf

	Overall strength
Metro Vancouver RD, BC	Strong
Squamish-Lillooet RD Area C	Strong
RD North Okanagan	Strong
Thompson-Nicola RD	Strong
Cariboo RD, BC	Somewhat Strong
RD Central Kootenay	Somewhat Strong
RD Bulkley-Nechako, BC	Somewhat Strong
RD Okanagan-Similkameen	Somewhat Strong
RD Central Okanagan	Moderate
Capital RD, BC	Moderate
Peace River RD, BC	Moderate
RD Kootenay Boundary	Somewhat Weak
RD Fraser-Fort George, BC	Somewhat Weak
Fraser Valley RD, BC	Somewhat Weak
Columbia Shuswap RD	Somewhat Weak
Kitimat-Stikine RD, BC	Somewhat Weak

#### **BC Lower Mainland**

British Co	احسناه	hia 7	$\sim \sim 1$
וואווחו		DIA /	$O \cap C \cap C$

Somewhat Strong

Metro Vancouver RD, BC

Delta. BC

Surrey, BC

Richmond, BC

Pitt Meadows, BC

Township of Langley, BC

Coquitlam, BC

Maple Ridge, BC

Port Coquitlam, BC

Strong

Very Strong

Strong

Strong

Strong

Moderate

Moderate

Somewhat Weak

Somewhat Weak

Fraser Valley RD, BC

Chilliwack, BC

District of Kent, BC

Abbotsford, BC

FVRD Area G

Somewhat Weak

Somewhat Strong

Somewhat Strong

Moderate

Moderate

	POLICY	LEGISLATION	GOVERNANCE
PROVINCIAL	[MAL] Strengthening Farming [ALC] ALR and Community Planning Guidelines [Smith] "Planning for Agriculture"	Agricultural Land Commission Act Local Government Act Farm Practices Protection (Right to Farm) Act Forest and Range Practices Act Range Act Land Title Act Agricultural Land Reserve Use, Subdivision, and Procedure Regulation	Agricultural Land Commission [ALC Act] Administrative Tribunals Act Governance Policy for the Agricultural Land Commission
		LGA Part 13 s.428(2)(e) Purpose of regional growth strategrity of a secure and productive resource base, including the agents	
REGIONAL	CRD Agricultural Policy (2014) CCBAC Agriculture Sector Strategy (2007) Williams Lake SRMP (2005)	Quesnel Fringe Area OCP (2014) Quesnel Fringe Area Zoning 3504 (2000) Williams Lake Fringe Area OCP 4782 (2013) Williams Lake Fringe and 150 Mile House Area Zoning 3502 (1999) South Cariboo Area OCP 5171 (2018) South Cariboo Area Zoning (3501) 150 Mile House Area OCP (2012) Green Lake and Area OCP (2012) Interlakes Area OCP (2004) Lac La Hache Area OCP (2018) Central Cariboo Area Rural Land Use 3503 (1999)	ALC Interior Panel Advisory Planning Commission
	ALC Act 46(4) Conflict with Bylaws  A local government bylaw or a first nation government law that is inconsistent with this Act, the regulations or an order of the commission has, to the extent of the inconsistency, no force or effect.  LGA Part 13 s.475(4) consultation during development of an OCP: must consult with the Agricultural Land Commission.  LGA Part 13 477(3)(b)Adoption procedures for an OCP: refer the plan to the ALC for comment ALC Act 13 Dispute resolution on community issues		
MUNICIPAL		Quesnel OCP 1879 (2019) Quesnel Zoning 1880 (2019) Williams Lake OCP 2140 (2011) Williams Lake Zoning 1825 (2002) 100 Mile House OCP 1288 (2016) 100 Mile House Zoning 1290 (2016)	Advisory Planning Commissions

	POLICY	LEGISLATION	GOVERNANCE
PROVINCIAL	[MAL] Strengthening Farming [ALC] ALR and Community Planning Guidelines [Smith] "Planning for Agriculture"	Agricultural Land Commission Act Local Government Act Farm Practices Protection (Right to Farm) Act Forest and Range Practices Act Range Act Land Title Act Agricultural Land Reserve Use, Subdivision, and Procedure Regulation	Agricultural Land Commission [ALC Act] Administrative Tribunals Act Governance Policy for the Agricultural Land Commission
		LGA Part 13 s.428(2)(e) Purpose of regional growth strategrity of a secure and productive resource base, including the a	
REGIONAL	CRD Agricultural Policy (2014) CCBAC Agriculture Sector Strategy (2007) Williams Lake SRMP (2005)	Quesnel Fringe Area OCP (2014) Quesnel Fringe Area Zoning 3504 (2000) Williams Lake Fringe Area OCP 4782 (2013) Williams Lake Fringe and 150 Mile House Area Zoning 3502 (1999) South Cariboo Area OCP 5171 (2018) South Cariboo Area Zoning (3501) 150 Mile House Area OCP (2012) Green Lake and Area OCP (2012) Interlakes Area OCP (2004) Lac La Hache Area OCP (2018) Central Cariboo Area Rural Land Use 3503 (1999)	ALC Interior Panel Advisory Planning Commission
	ALC Act 46(4) Conflict with Bylaws  A local government bylaw or a first nation government law that is inconsistent with this Act, the regulations or an order of the commission has, to the extent of the inconsistency, no force or effect.  LGA Part 13 s.475(4) consultation during development of an OCP: must consult with the Agricultural Land Commission.  LGA Part 13 477(3)(b)Adoption procedures for an OCP: refer the plan to the ALC for comment ALC Act 13 Dispute resolution on community issues		
MUNICIPAL		Quesnel OCP 1879 (2019) Quesnel Zoning 1880 (2019) Williams Lake OCP 2140 (2011) Williams Lake Zoning 1825 (2002) 100 Mile House OCP 1288 (2016) 100 Mile House Zoning 1290 (2016)	Advisory Planning Commissions

	POLICY	LEGISLATION	GOVERNANCE
PROVINCIAL	[MAL] Strengthening Farming [ALC] ALR and Community Planning Guidelines [Smith] "Planning for Agriculture"	Agricultural Land Commission Act Local Government Act Farm Practices Protection (Right to Farm) Act Forest and Range Practices Act Range Act Land Title Act Agricultural Land Reserve Use, Subdivision, and Procedure Regulation	Agricultural Land Commission [ALC Act] Administrative Tribunals Act Governance Policy for the Agricultural Land Commission
		LGA Part 13 s.428(2)(e) Purpose of regional growth strategrity of a secure and productive resource base, including the a	
REGIONAL	CRD Agricultural Policy (2014) CCBAC Agriculture Sector Strategy (2007) Williams Lake SRMP (2005)	Quesnel Fringe Area OCP (2014) Quesnel Fringe Area Zoning 3504 (2000) Williams Lake Fringe Area OCP 4782 (2013) Williams Lake Fringe and 150 Mile House Area Zoning 3502 (1999) South Cariboo Area OCP 5171 (2018) South Cariboo Area Zoning (3501) 150 Mile House Area OCP (2012) Green Lake and Area OCP (2012) Interlakes Area OCP (2004) Lac La Hache Area OCP (2018) Central Cariboo Area Rural Land Use 3503 (1999)	ALC Interior Panel Advisory Planning Commission
	ALC Act 46(4) Conflict with Bylaws  A local government bylaw or a first nation government law that is inconsistent with this Act, the regulations or an order of the commission has, to the extent of the inconsistency, no force or effect.  LGA Part 13 s.475(4) consultation during development of an OCP: must consult with the Agricultural Land Commission.  LGA Part 13 477(3)(b)Adoption procedures for an OCP: refer the plan to the ALC for comment ALC Act 13 Dispute resolution on community issues		
MUNICIPAL		Quesnel OCP 1879 (2019) Quesnel Zoning 1880 (2019) Williams Lake OCP 2140 (2011) Williams Lake Zoning 1825 (2002) 100 Mile House OCP 1288 (2016) 100 Mile House Zoning 1290 (2016)	Advisory Planning Commissions

	POLICY	LEGISLATION	GOVERNANCE
PROVINCIAL	[MAL] Strengthening Farming [ALC] ALR and Community Planning Guidelines [Smith] "Planning for Agriculture"	Agricultural Land Commission Act Local Government Act Farm Practices Protection (Right to Farm) Act Forest and Range Practices Act Range Act Land Title Act Agricultural Land Reserve Use, Subdivision, and Procedure Regulation	Agricultural Land Commission [ALC Act] Administrative Tribunals Act Governance Policy for the Agricultural Land Commission
		LGA Part 13 s.428(2)(e) Purpose of regional growth strategrity of a secure and productive resource base, including the against the secure and productive resource base, including the against the secure and productive resource base, including the against the secure and productive resource base, including the against the secure and productive resource base, including the against the secure and productive resource base, including the against the secure and productive resource base, including the against the secure and productive resource base, including the against the secure and productive resource base, including the against the secure and productive resource base, including the against the secure and productive resource base, including the against the secure and productive resource base, including the against the secure and productive resource base, and the secure and productive resource and the secure and th	
REGIONAL	CRD Agricultural Policy (2014) CCBAC Agriculture Sector Strategy (2007) Williams Lake SRMP (2005)	Quesnel Fringe Area OCP (2014) Quesnel Fringe Area Zoning 3504 (2000) Williams Lake Fringe Area OCP 4782 (2013) Williams Lake Fringe and 150 Mile House Area Zoning 3502 (1999) South Cariboo Area OCP 5171 (2018) South Cariboo Area Zoning (3501) 150 Mile House Area OCP (2012) Green Lake and Area OCP (2012) Interlakes Area OCP (2004) Lac La Hache Area OCP (2018) Central Cariboo Area Rural Land Use 3503 (1999)	ALC Interior Panel Advisory Planning Commission
	ALC Act 46(4) Conflict with Bylaws  A local government bylaw or a first nation government law that is inconsistent with this Act, the regulations or an order of the commission has, to the extent of the inconsistency, no force or effect.  LGA Part 13 s.475(4) consultation during development of an OCP: must consult with the Agricultural Land Commission.  LGA Part 13 477(3)(b) Adoption procedures for an OCP: refer the plan to the ALC for comment ALC Act 13 Dispute resolution on community issues		
MUNICIPAL		Quesnel OCP 1879 (2019) Quesnel Zoning 1880 (2019) Williams Lake OCP 2140 (2011) Williams Lake Zoning 1825 (2002) 100 Mile House OCP 1288 (2016) 100 Mile House Zoning 1290 (2016)	Advisory Planning Commissions

	POLICY	LEGISLATION	GOVERNANCE
PROVINCIAL	[MAL] Strengthening Farming [ALC] ALR and Community Planning Guidelines [Smith] "Planning for Agriculture"	Agricultural Land Commission Act Local Government Act Farm Practices Protection (Right to Farm) Act Forest and Range Practices Act Range Act Land Title Act Agricultural Land Reserve Use, Subdivision, and Procedure Regulation	Agricultural Land Commission [ALC Act] Administrative Tribunals Act Governance Policy for the Agricultural Land Commission
		LGA Part 13 s.428(2)(e) Purpose of regional growth strategrity of a secure and productive resource base, including the ag	
REGIONAL	CRD Agricultural Policy (2014) CCBAC Agriculture Sector Strategy (2007) Williams Lake SRMP (2005)	Quesnel Fringe Area OCP (2014) Quesnel Fringe Area Zoning 3504 (2000) Williams Lake Fringe Area OCP 4782 (2013) Williams Lake Fringe and 150 Mile House Area Zoning 3502 (1999) South Cariboo Area OCP 5171 (2018) South Cariboo Area Zoning (3501) 150 Mile House Area OCP (2012) Green Lake and Area OCP (2012) Interlakes Area OCP (2004) Lac La Hache Area OCP (2018) Central Cariboo Area Rural Land Use 3503 (1999)	ALC Interior Panel Advisory Planning Commission
	ALC Act 46(4) Conflict with Bylaws  A local government bylaw or a first nation government law that is inconsistent with this Act, the regulations or an order of the commission has, to the extent of the inconsistency, no force or effect.  LGA Part 13 s.475(4) consultation during development of an OCP: must consult with the Agricultural Land Commission.  LGA Part 13 477(3)(b)Adoption procedures for an OCP: refer the plan to the ALC for comment  ALC Act 13 Dispute resolution on community issues		
MUNICIPAL		Quesnel OCP 1879 (2019) Quesnel Zoning 1880 (2019) Williams Lake OCP 2140 (2011) Williams Lake Zoning 1825 (2002) 100 Mile House OCP 1288 (2016) 100 Mile House Zoning 1290 (2016)	Advisory Planning Commissions

#### Four principles of public policy

- 1. Maximise stability
- 2. Integrate public priorities across jurisdictions
- 3. Minimise uncertainty

Only after one takes care of the first three...

4. Accommodate flexibility

#### Published journal article:

Connell, David J., and Lou-Anne Daoust-Filiatrault (2017). Better Than Good: Three Dimensions of Plan Quality. *Journal of Planning Education and Research*, 1-8. [open access]

### Four principles at local level Maximise stability

- Policies and statements specific to protecting the agricultural land base
  - Clear, direct language
  - Type of document
  - Location in document
  - Multiple references

### Four principles at local level Integrate across jurisdictions

- References to other areas of jurisdiction
  - Vertical and horizontal
- Level of detail
- Frequency of references

### Four principles at local level Minimise uncertainty

- Urban growth boundaries
  - How permanent? How changed?
- Other factors:
  - Open-ended statements
  - Internal consistency
  - Covenants
  - Study areas

### Four principles at local level Accommodate flexibility

- Accommodating specific non-farm development to meet local interests
  - Governance mechanisms
    - Agricultural advisory committees
  - Agricultural impact assessments (AIAs)
  - Recognising 'right to farm' legislation
  - Adopting development permit areas
  - Incorporating edge planning (e.g. buffers)

Overall strength

Metro Vancouver RD, BC

Squamish-Lillooet RD Area C

RD North Okanagan

Thompson-Nicola RD

Cariboo RD, BC

**RD Central Kootenay** 

RD Bulkley-Nechako, BC

RD Okanagan-Similkameen

RD Central Okanagan

Capital RD, BC

Peace River RD, BC

**RD Kootenay Boundary** 

RD Fraser-Fort George, BC

Fraser Valley RD, BC

Columbia Shuswap RD

Kitimat-Stikine RD, BC

Strong

Strong

Strong

Strong

Somewhat Strong

Somewhat Strong

Somewhat Strong

Somewhat Strong

Moderate

Moderate

Moderate

Somewhat Weak

Somewhat Weak

Somewhat Weak

Somewhat Weak

Somewhat Weak

			Integrate	Minimise	
		Maximise	across	uncertaint	Accomm.
	Overall strength	stability	jurisd.	У	flexibility
Metro Vancouver RD, BC	Strong				
Squamish-Lillooet RD Area C	Strong				
RD North Okanagan	Strong				
Thompson-Nicola RD	Strong				
Cariboo RD, BC	Somewhat Strong				
RD Central Kootenay	Somewhat Strong				
RD Bulkley-Nechako, BC	Somewhat Strong				
RD Okanagan-Similkameen	Somewhat Strong				
RD Central Okanagan	Moderate				
Capital RD, BC	Moderate				
Peace River RD, BC	Moderate				
RD Kootenay Boundary	Somewhat Weak				
RD Fraser-Fort George, BC	Somewhat Weak				
Fraser Valley RD, BC	Somewhat Weak				
Columbia Shuswap RD	Somewhat Weak				
Kitimat-Stikine RD, BC	Somewhat Weak				

	Our well at war at h	Maximise	Integrate across	Minimise uncertaint	Accomm.
	Overall strength	stability	jurisd.	У	flexibility
Metro Vancouver RD, BC	Strong	5	4	5	3
Squamish-Lillooet RD Area C	Strong	4	4	3	4
RD North Okanagan	Strong	4	4	4	3
Thompson-Nicola RD	Strong	4	4	4	4
Cariboo RD, BC	Somewhat Strong	4	4	3	3
RD Central Kootenay	Somewhat Strong	4	4	2	3
RD Bulkley-Nechako, BC	Somewhat Strong	4	4	3	2
RD Okanagan-Similkameen	Somewhat Strong	4	3	4	3
RD Central Okanagan	Moderate	3	3	3	3
Capital RD, BC	Moderate	3	2	4	2
Peace River RD, BC	Moderate	4	3	2	4
RD Kootenay Boundary	Somewhat Weak	3	3	2	2
RD Fraser-Fort George, BC	Somewhat Weak	2	2	3	4
Fraser Valley RD, BC	Somewhat Weak	3	2	2	2
Columbia Shuswap RD	Somewhat Weak	3	2	2	2
Kitimat-Stikine RD, BC	Somewhat Weak	3	1	2	2

Metro Vancouver RD, BC
Squamish-Lillooet RD Area C
RD North Okanagan
Thompson-Nicola RD
Cariboo RD, BC

Overall strength
Strong
Strong
Strong
Strong
Strong

- What commitment do you want to make to protect agricultural land?
- How strongly do you want to express this commitment?

RD Fraser-Fort George, BC
Fraser Valley RD, BC
Columbia Shuswap RD
Kitimat-Stikine RD, BC

Somewhat Weak
Somewhat Weak
Somewhat Weak

Maximise stability	Integrate across jurisd.	Minimise uncertaint y	Accomm. flexibility
5	4	5	3
4	4	3	4
4	4	4	3
4	4	4	4
4	4	3	3
4	4	2	3
4	4	3	2
4	3	4	3
3	3	3	3
3	2	4	2
4	3	2	4
3	3	2	2
2	2	3	4
3	2	2	2
3	2	2	2
3	1	2	2

Metro Vancouver RD, BC
Squamish-Lillooet RD Area C
RD North Okanagan
Thompson-Nicola RD
Cariboo RD, BC

Overall strength					
Strong					
Somewhat Strong					

Overall strongth

- Do you want to express support for the provincial legislation (ALR, ALC)?
- How strongly do you want to express this support?

RD Fraser-Fort George, BC
Fraser Valley RD, BC
Columbia Shuswap RD
Kitimat-Stikine RD, BC

-	
	Somewhat Weak
	Somewhat Weak
	Somewhat Weak
	Somewhat Weak

	Intograta	Minimise	
N 4 - 1 - 1 - 1	Integrate		•
Maximise	across	uncertaint	Accomm.
stability	jurisd.	У	flexibility
5	4	5	3
4	4	3	4
4	4	4	3
4	4	4	4
4	4	3	3
4	4	2	3
4	4	3	2
4	3	4	3
3	3	3	3
3	2	4	2
4	3	2	4
3	3	2	2
2	2	3	4
3	2	2	2
3	2	2	2
3	1	2	2

Metro Vancouver RD, BC
Squamish-Lillooet RD Area C
RD North Okanagan
Thompson-Nicola RD
Cariboo RD, BC

- Do you want to commit to restricting urban/non-farm development?
- How strongly do you want to express this commitment?
- To what extent do you want to leave options for urban development open?

	Integrate	Minimise		
Maximise	across	uncertaint	Accomm.	
stability jurisd.		У	flexibility	
5	4	5	3	
4	4	3	4	
4	4	4	3	
4	4	4	4	
4	4	3	3	
4	4	2	3	
4	4	3	2	
4	3	4	3	
3	3	3	3	
3	2	4	2	
4	3	2	4	
3	3	2	2	
2	2	3	4	
3	2	2	2	
3	2	2	2	
3	1	2	2	

Metro Vancouver RD, BC
Squamish-Lillooet RD Area C
RD North Okanagan
Thompson-Nicola RD
Cariboo RD, BC

Overall strength					
Strong					
Strong Strong Strong					
					Somewhat Strong

•	Are there any specific non-farm
	development opportunities that
	you know you want to consider
	in the future?

- What factors must be considered to approve these opportunities?
- How will you mitigate negative impacts on farmland?

		Integrate	Minimise	
Maximise stability		across	uncertaint	Accomm.
		jurisd.	У	flexibility
	5	4	5	3
	4	4	3	4
	4	4	4	3
	4	4	4	4
	4	4	3	3
	4	4	2	3
1	4	4	3	2
<b>.</b>	4	3	4	3
	3	3	3	3
	3	2	4	2
	4	3	2	4
	3	3	2	2
	2	2	3	4
	3	2	2	2
	3	2	2	2
	3	1	2	2

#### Contact information

#### David J. Connell, PhD RPP MCIP

Associate Professor, Ecosystem Science and Management

david.connell@unbc.ca

250-960-5835

Website:

www.AgLUP.org



### Strength of legislative frameworks: BC lower mainland

SITE	Overall strength	Maximise stability	Integrate across jurisd.	Minimise uncertainty	Accomm. flexibility
British Columbia Zone 1	Somewhat Strong	5	3	4	4
Metro Vancouver RD, BC	Strong	5	4	5	3
Delta. BC	Very Strong	5	5	4	4
Surrey, BC	Strong	5	4	4	5
Richmond, BC	Strong	5	4	4	4
Pitt Meadows, BC	Strong	4	4	4	3
Township of Langley, BC	Moderate	3	4	2	3
Coquitlam, BC	Moderate	3	3	3	2
Maple Ridge, BC	Somewhat Weak	3	3	2	3
Port Coquitlam, BC	Somewhat Weak	2	2	2	2
Fraser Valley RD, BC	Somewhat Weak	3	2	2	2
Chilliwack, BC	Somewhat Strong	5	4	2	3
District of Kent, BC	Somewhat Strong	5	4	3	3
Abbotsford, BC	Moderate	4	2	3	5
FVRD Area G	Moderate	3	3	3	3